

Workshop Report

Measuring Health Systems Performance

18-19 March 2019, New Delhi



Workshop Objectives

Health Systems Transformation Platform is incubated in the Tata Trusts family. HSTP is an enabler of systems change supporting re-design of India's health system's architecture & function based on systems assessment, policy relevant research/evidence synthesis and conducting experiments that focus on health outcomes to re-engineer health interventions. HSTP's focus is on:

- Medium & long term learnings from Innovations & transformations in Indian and global health systems.
- Talent and capability building in India on health systems research, leadership, policy & strategy formulation.
- Being a safe space for policy dialogue, knowledge sharing & learning among stakeholders involved in or affected by policy & opportunities facing Indian health system.

This workshop on **measuring health systems performance** is part of HSTP's program for enhancing capacities of Indian researchers and is executed in collaboration with Harvard School of Public Health and Indian experts in the field. Learning is facilitated through knowledge exchange from researcher's experience. Sessions are not didactic and are designed to facilitate discussions on the principles, approaches and methodologies of various research topics. The workshop provided a learning platform for 24 Indian researchers.

The objective of the workshop was to enhance the understanding of measuring performance of the Indian/state health system focused on recent policy commitments related to healthcare financing (raising government health expenditures, strategic purchasing, reducing catastrophic out of pocket health expenditures through Ayushman Bharat, free drugs and diagnostics initiatives etc.) Enhancing research capacities in measuring health systems performance is necessary as it brings clarity on methodological approach toward diagnosing health system problems, backed by reliable and timely data of appropriate quality. To this effect, if targeted at various levels within the health system, it can better guide health policy interpretation, support evidence-informed policy interventions and enforce accountability for any inter- or intra- state discrepancies in system performance.

K Rahul S Reddy, HSTP; Anuska Kalita, HSPH; Indranil Mukhopadhyaya, Jindal School of Government and Policy; Shailendra K Hooda, Institute for Studies in Industrial Development facilitated sessions with a focus on principles, approaches /research methodologies, structuring discussions around experiences of participating researchers and reflecting on way forward to enhance knowledge/skills.

We are grateful for guidance from Dr. Maharaj Kishan Bhan (Chair-HSTP Board), Prof. Winnie Yip (Harvard School of Public Health) & contribution of HSTP & Tata Trusts team - Salil Kumar, Bhupendra Prabhakar & Peter Parekattil.

Learnings Shared

The two-day workshop was programmed to highlight learnings from four topics mentioned here. A unique feature was celebrating Prof. Indrani Gupta or Prof Muraleedharan - whose work contributed to an evolved understanding of Indian health systems, influenced health policy decisions and inspired young researchers. They gave an insight into their thought process and approach to research emphasising that nuances are imbibed only by continuously learning from communities, solving complex issues in a multi-disciplinary team, being open to new methods and experiences. Dr. Rajeev Sadanandan & Mr. HSD Srinivas also addressed the participants during the inaugural.

Health Accounts as a tool for health systems analysis: Health Accounts generates systematic description of fund flows in the health system and consistent estimates for health financing indicators in a country/ state/ province. It answers what health care goods and services are consumed? Which health care providers deliver these? And Who pays for these goods and services? Experiences from Indian health accounts, Odisha state health accounts and study of Indian urban local self-government expenditures provided an insight into the policy implications of the results and monitoring progress of SDGs, the national health policy and Ayushman Bharat. Researchers discussed the critical challenges related to expenditure data availability, periodicity, quality, management, interpretation of estimates and indicators in view of lack of proper knowledge among stakeholders.

Measuring Access, Equity and Quality: measuring these intermediary outcomes of health system is rife with conceptual and practical challenges. In the India studies are limited to analysing these dimensions using survey datasets - NSSO, NFHS and others. A major drawback is, these do not capture information to measure unmet need - important to understand access and care seeking behaviour. Need to move beyond input based assessment of quality of care and determinants of health equity were discussed in depth. Practical issues in understanding contexts in remote areas like the Sundarbans or tribal areas highlighted that qualitative research studies are critical in measuring equity and access, for developing strategies to address these issues.

Financial Risk Protection: Measuring out of pocket payments on health and their severity (catastrophe and impoverishment) provide an understanding of financial risk protection. Methodologies of each and the merits and de-merits were discussed. Experiences from an in-depth analysis of OOP and Cata for population covered under the Government health insurance in Rajasthan and expenditures of road traffic accidents highlighted the evidence available in India using the most recent methods and analytical frameworks. Researchers also deliberated on the data availability, methodology and Indicators for measuring FRP in India's progress towards Universal Health Coverage - noteworthy was emergence of a consensus to work on methodologies to capture a large segment of the population that is not featured in FRP analysis as it doesn't access healthcare due to financial barriers.

Evaluating Health Programs: Evaluations generate a policy feedback loop to make programs efficient and effective in terms of targeting, operations, outputs/ outcomes and impact on human health. Popular methods used; the need to use mixed methods and move away from the common experimental designs for health systems evaluation were highlighted; challenges in contextualizing theoretical principles to realities of Indian/ State Context were discussed based on sharing experience of a study that reviewed PPPs in health in the State of Odisha.

What Next ?

Robust scientific research and evidence synthesis is fundamental to evidence based policy making in India. At the core of this are the Indian researchers. We value their contribution to current understanding of the Indian health system. To enable transformation and lead the system towards universal health coverage and Sustainable Development Goals, India needs enhanced research capacities especially in health systems diagnostics, design, policy, strategy and measuring performance. HSTP's program on enhancing capacities of Indian researchers is committed to work in this direction. This workshop provided a platform for researchers to network with peers and learn from each other's work. This not only allows on developing new research skill sets, but also introspect and reflect one's own thinking and approach to research. Looking forward, we envisage to engage with Indian researchers on the following lines:

- To build a network of researchers who are peers and learn from each other, help each other.
- To identify researchers who are interested to be more engaged with HSTP's research agenda, develop longer term collaborations and also be future trainers at our other programs.
- Understand the needs of researchers and build our training programs around addressing these needs. In this regards, a brief survey was conducted at the end of the workshop. Participating researchers reported they need support in terms of - funding for research and dissemination of findings; skills in communicating findings to policy makers and other stakeholders; skills in advanced statistical modelling and analysis, equity analysis, costing of health services, Health Technology Assessments, benefit incidence analysis, systematic reviews, tracking health spending.
- Developing HSTP as a platform for exchanging ideas, research findings, learnings and bridging gap between researchers and users of this knowledge/evidence.

Workshop Agenda

Venue – The Dome, Vivanta Ambassador, Sujan Singh Park, New Delhi.

Day 1	18 March 2019
9.00 - 9.15	Welcome and Introductions Rahul Reddy, Health Systems Transformation Platform; HSD Srinivas, Tata Trusts Anuska Kalita, Harvard School of Public Health; Dr. Rajeev Sadanandan, Kerala
9.15 - 10.30	Oration: A profound Idea in a Researcher's Journey Prof. Muraleedharan, Indian Institute of Technology Madras Prof. Indrani Gupta, Institute of Economic Growth
10.30 - 11.00	Break for Tea
11.0 - 12.00	Session 1: Health Accounts: A Tool for Health Systems Analysis Rahul Reddy, Health Systems Transformation Platform <i>Researcher Experiences:</i> Sarit Rout, Indian Institute of Public Health Bhubaneswar Sandeep Sharma, National Health Systems Resource Centre, Delhi
12.00 - 1.00	Group work and Discussion
1.00 - 2.00	Break for Lunch
2.00 - 3.45	Session 2: Measuring Access, Equity and Quality in Health Systems Indranil Mukhopadhyaya, Jindal School of Government and Policy <i>Researcher Experiences:</i> Bhuputra Panda, Indian Institute of Public Health Bhubaneswar Debjani Barman, Indian Institute of Health Management Research Upendra Bhojani, Institute of Public Health Bengaluru Atul Sharma, PGIMER School of Public Health Chandigarh
3.45 - 4.00	Break for Tea
4.00 - 5.00	Group work and Discussion
Day 2	19 March 2019
9.00 - 10.30	Session 3: Measuring Financial Risk Protection Shailendra K Hooda, Institute for studies in Industrial Development <i>Researcher Experiences:</i> Montu Bose, The Energy and Resources Institute, Delhi Jalandhar Pradhan, National Institute of Technology, Rourkela
10.30 - 11.00	Break for Tea
11.00 - 1.00	Session 4: Evaluating Health Programs Anuska Kalita, Harvard School of Public Health <i>Researcher Experiences:</i> Srinivas N, Indian Institute of Public Health Bhubaneswar
1.00 – 2.00	Break for Lunch
2.00 – 4.00	Discussion on Way Forward

Facilitators & Participants

Name	Designation	University/Institution
Harilal Madhavan	Ad(Hoc) Faculty	Indian Institute of Science Education and Research, Trivandrum
Debjani Barman	Assistant Professor	Institute of Health Management Research
Harsha Joshi	Consultant	National Health Systems Resource Centre, Delhi
Shailey Ghokle	Consultant	National Health Systems Resource Centre, Delhi
Sarit Rout	Associate Professor	Indian Institute of Public Health Bhubaneshwar
Srinivas	Associate Professor	Indian Institute of Public Health Bhubaneshwar
Bhuputra Panda	Adjunct Add. Professor	Indian Institute of Public Health Bhubaneshwar
Jalandhar Pradhan	Associate Professor	National Institute of Technology, Rourkela
Atul Sharma	Research Scientist	PGIMER School of Public Health, Chandigarh
Upendra Bhojani	Assistant Professor	Institute of Public Health Bengaluru
Joel Basumatary	Assistant Professor	Government of Puducherry
Samik Choudhury	Associate Professor	Ambedkar University, Delhi
Montu Bose	Assistant Professor	TERI University, Delhi
Sandeep Sharma	Consultant	National Health Systems Resource Centre, Delhi
Sudha Chandrasekhar	Consultant	Health Systems Transformation Platform
Niranjan Kumar	Consultant	Tata Trusts
Vikram Sahane	Consultant	Tata Trusts
Sreejini Jaya	PhD Scholar	Achutha Menon Centre for Health Science Studies
Maneeta Jain	Consultant	Christian Medical College, Ludhiana
Mampi Bose	Policy Analyst	Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability
Vivek Panwar	Consultant	National Health Systems Resource Centre
Tarun Shankar Choudhury	Doctoral Student	Society for Applied Sciences (KnIT)
Gunjeet Kaur	Doctoral Student	PGIMER School of Public Health, Chandigarh
Dorothy Lall	Doctoral Student	Institute of Public Health Bengaluru
Shailender K. Hooda*	Assistant Professor	Institute for Studies in Industrial Development, Delhi
Indranil Mukhopadhyaya*	Associate Professor	Jindal School of Government and Policy
K Rahul S Reddy*	Senior Fellow	Health Systems Transformation Platform
Anuska Kalita*	Specialist & coordinator	Harvard School of Public Health



Contact

Rahul S Reddy Kadarpetta | National Coordinator, HSTP | rreddy@hstp.org.in

This report titled ‘Measuring Health Systems Performance’ has been developed by Health Systems Transformation Platform (HSTP) and the partner(s) to share the summary of proceedings of this workshop.

Disclaimer

Health Systems Transformation Platform is incubated in the Tata Trusts family as a not for profit organization registered in the name of Forum for Health Systems Design and Transformation, a company licensed under section 8 of the Indian Companies Act 2013.

Our mission is to enable Indian health systems respond to people’s needs. We do this in collaboration with Indian & Global expertise through research for health systems design, enhancing stakeholders’ capabilities and fostering policy dialogue.

HSTP activities are funded by Sir Ratan Tata Trusts. HSTP is committed to highest standards of ethics and professional integrity in all its endeavours and declares no conflict of interest on account of its funding arrangements. The funders have no role in planning, design, development, and execution of any HSTP activities including organization of meetings/ workshops/ trainings/ research/ publications/ and any other dissemination material developed for the use of health systems stakeholders in India and elsewhere.

The contents of this report should not be attributed to, and do not represent the views of the funders. All reasonable precautions have been taken by HSTP and its partners to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall HSTP and its partners be liable for damages arising from its use.